

This record is a partial extract of the original cable. The full text of the original cable is not available.

UNCLAS SECTION 01 OF 02 VATICAN 004241

SIPDIS

SENSITIVE

DEPT FOR EUR/WE (MENNUTI)

E.O. 12958: N/A

TAGS: [KSCA](#) [PREL](#) [AORC](#) [TBIO](#) [TPHY](#) [KSCA](#) [PREL](#) [AORC](#) [TBIO](#) [TPHY](#) [VT](#) [UNGA](#) [VTUNGA](#)

SUBJECT: VATICAN ON CLONING CONVENTION: DON'T MAKE THE
IDEAL THE ENEMY OF THE GOOD

REF: STATE 160115

1. (SBU) SUMMARY: VATICAN DFM MIGLIORE TOLD DCM AUGUST 30
THAT THE HOLY SEE SHARED U.S. GOALS ON THE CLONING CONVENTION
AND SUPPORTED USG EFFORTS TO ACHIEVE A UN CONVENTION TO BAN
ALL FORMS OF HUMAN CLONING. HOWEVER, THE VATICAN FEARED THAT
UNCLASSIFIED

PAGE 02 VATICA 04241 01 OF 02 030554Z
PRESSING TOO HARD FOR A COMPREHENSIVE BAN NOW MIGHT LEAD TO A
MISSED OPPORTUNITY TO ACHIEVE A GLOBAL BAN ON HUMAN CLONING
THAT THE HOLY SEE REGARDS AS FUNDAMENTAL. THE HOLY SEE IS
PREPARED TO WORK WITH THE U.S. IN THE LEAD UP TO THE UNGA IN
PURSUIT OF A TOTAL BAN, AND MIGLIORE TOOK ON BOARD THE NAMES
OF THE COUNTRIES WHICH REFTTEL RECOMMENDS THEY APPROACH.
NEVERTHELESS, THE HOLY SEE IS PREPARED TO PURSUE AN
ALTERNATIVE APPROACH IF IT APPEARS THAT A COMPREHENSIVE BAN
IS IMPOSSIBLE TO ACHIEVE. THE ALTERNATIVE WOULD DELETE THE
LANGUAGE IN THE CURRENT DRAFT UN RESOLUTION THAT LEAVES OPEN
OTHER HUMAN CLONING ACTIVITIES, WHILE RETAINING EXPLICIT
REFERENCES TO THE INTENT TO MOVE AFTER PHASE ONE
(REPRODUCTIVE CLONING) TO A PHASE TWO THAT WOULD BAN ALL
OTHER FORMS OF HUMAN CLONING. THE HOLY SEE BELIEVES THIS
WOULD ESTABLISH THE PRINCIPLE THAT ALL FORMS OF HUMAN CLONING
ARE CURRENTLY REGARDED AS "UNACCEPTABLE." END SUMMARY.

2. (SBU) DCM PRESENTED REFTTEL REQUEST TO VATICAN DFM
CELESTINO MIGLIORE ON AUGUST 30. MIGLIORE INDICATED HE HAD
HEARD FROM THE HOLY SEE'S PERMANENT OBSERVER MISSION IN NEW
YORK ABOUT THE U.S. APPROACH, AND CAUTIONED THAT THE U.S.
MIGHT BE TOO AMBITIOUS. HE SAID THAT THE HOLY SEE FULLY
SUPPORTED US EFFORTS TO ACHIEVE A COMPREHENSIVE BAN ON HUMAN
CLONING BECAUSE WE SHARE THE SAME STRONG MORAL CONCERNS. HE
FEARED, HOWEVER, THAT IT WOULD PROVE IMPOSSIBLE TO GENERATE
THE VOTES AT THIS TIME TO AUTHORIZE A CONVENTION ON A
COMPREHENSIVE BAN ON HUMAN CLONING. IN THIS CASE, THE HOLY
SEE BELIEVED IT COULD PROVE IMPOSSIBLE TO REGAIN THE MOMENTUM
FOR SUCH A BAN IN THE FUTURE, AND THE MOMENT TO ACHIEVE A BAN
ON HUMAN CLONING COULD PASS. MIGLIORE PREFERRED TO PRESS NOW
FOR THE PHASE ONE BAN AS PROPOSED BY THE FRENCH AND GERMANS
UNCLASSIFIED

PAGE 03 VATICA 04241 01 OF 02 030554Z
BUT WITH CHANGED LANGUAGE IN THE AUTHORIZING RESOLUTION.

3. (SBU) WHILE THE HOLY SEE AGREED THAT THE TWO PHASE
APPROACH CARRIED RISKS, THEY HAD DEVELOPED AN ALTERNATIVE TO
THE FRENCH AND GERMAN PROPOSAL THAT THEY BELIEVED COULD
ESTABLISH THE PRINCIPLE AGAINST ALL FORMS OF HUMAN CLONING,
WHILE LOCKING IN A COMMITMENT TO NEGOTIATIONS ON THE SECOND
STEP. SPECIFICALLY, THE HOLY SEE WOULD PROPOSE DELETING OP
3(B), WHICH HE PARAPHRASED AS READING: "THE SOCIAL COMMITTEE
CLARIFIES THAT A BAN ON HUMAN REPRODUCTIVE CLONING IS NOT TO
PREJUDICE THE LEGALITY OR ILLEGALITY OF OTHER HUMAN CLONING
ACTIVITIES." THIS DELETION, COMBINED WITH EXISTING LANGUAGE
FURTHER DOWN IN THE RESOLUTION EXPLICITLY CALLING FOR BOTH A
BAN ON REPRODUCTIVE CLONING AND A SUBSEQUENT CONVENTION
BANNING ALL OTHER FORMS OF HUMAN CLONING WOULD ESTABLISH THE
PRINCIPLE THAT ANY FORM OF HUMAN CLONING WAS "INADMISSIBLE"
WHILE OFFERING A WAY TO MOVE FORWARD NOW, MIGLIORE MAINTAINED.

4. (SBU) DCM ASSURED MIGLIORE THAT THE USG APPRECIATED THE
HOLY SEE'S DESIRE TO LOCK IN THE PRINCIPLE BANNING HUMAN
REPRODUCTIVE CLONING IN THE EVENT A COMPREHENSIVE BAN
APPEARED UNATTAINABLE. HE REITERATED THAT AT THIS POINT,
HOWEVER, THE US BELIEVED IT WAS POSSIBLE TO BUILD CONSENSUS
FOR THE CONVENTION ON A COMPREHENSIVE BAN AND INTENDED TO
WORK HARD TO BUILD A COALITION TO THAT END. DCM PRESSED
MIGLIORE TO JOIN US NOW IN PURSUIT OF A COMPREHENSIVE BAN,
WHILE KEEPING THEIR ALTERNATIVE APPROACH IN RESERVE FOR THE
TIME BEING. MIGLIORE INDICATED THE HOLY SEE WOULD WORK WITH

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED PTQ4886

PAGE 01 VATICA 04241 02 OF 02 030555Z
ACTION EUR-00

| | | | | | | | |
|------|--------|-------|--------|---------|---------|---------|---------|
| INFO | LOG-00 | NP-00 | AF-00 | ACQ-00 | CIAE-00 | USNW-00 | DODE-00 |
| | WHA-00 | DS-00 | EAP-00 | UTED-00 | VC-00 | HHS-01 | TEDE-00 |

INR-00 IO-00 VCE-00 NSAE-00 OES-01 OIC-02 PER-00
SSO-00 SS-00 TEST-00 DSCC-00 NFAT-00 SAS-00 /004W
-----E174A4 030555Z /38

O 030536Z SEP 02
FM AMEMBASSY VATICAN
TO SECSTATE WASHDC IMMEDIATE
INFO AMEMBASSY ABIDJAN PRIORITY
AMEMBASSY BELIZE PRIORITY
AMEMBASSY BOGOTA PRIORITY
AMEMBASSY BUENOS AIRES PRIORITY
AMEMBASSY CARACAS PRIORITY
AMEMBASSY GUATEMALA PRIORITY
AMEMBASSY HARARE PRIORITY
AMEMBASSY LA PAZ PRIORITY
AMEMBASSY LIMA PRIORITY
AMEMBASSY MADRID PRIORITY
AMEMBASSY MANILA PRIORITY
AMEMBASSY MEXICO PRIORITY
AMEMBASSY MONTEVIDEO PRIORITY
AMEMBASSY PRETORIA PRIORITY
AMEMBASSY QUITO PRIORITY
AMEMBASSY ROME PRIORITY
AMEMBASSY SAN JOSE PRIORITY
AMEMBASSY SAN SALVADOR PRIORITY
AMEMBASSY SANTIAGO PRIORITY
AMEMBASSY SANTO DOMINGO PRIORITY
AMEMBASSY WARSAW PRIORITY
USINT HAVANA PRIORITY
USMISSION USUN NEW YORK PRIORITY

UNCLAS SECTION 02 OF 02 VATICAN 004241

SIPDIS

SENSITIVE

DEPT FOR EUR/WE (MENNUIT)

E.O. 12958: N/A

TAGS: [KSCA](#) [PREL](#) [AORC](#) [TBIO](#) [TPHY](#) [KSCA](#) [PREL](#) [AORC](#) [TBIO](#) [TPHY](#) [VT](#) [UNGA](#) [VTUNGA](#)

SUBJECT: VATICAN ON CLONING CONVENTION: DON'T MAKE THE
IDEAL THE ENEMY OF THE GOOD

THE U.S. IN THIS FASHION, AND TOOK NOTE OF THE FIVE COUNTRIES
MENTIONED REFTTEL AS LIKELY TO BE OPEN TO HOLY SEE INFLUENCE.
STILL, HE REITERATED THAT THE HOLY SEE WOULD WANT TO PRESS
FOR ITS ALTERNATIVE LANGUAGE IF AND WHEN IT SAW THAT
CONSENSUS WAS BECOMING TOO HARD TO ACHIEVE.

15. (SBU) COMMENT: THE HOLY SEE'S CAUTION ON AN ISSUE THAT
UNCLASSIFIED

PAGE 02 VATICA 04241 02 OF 02 030555Z
GOES TO THE CORE OF ITS MISSION WAS SURPRISING, PARTICULARLY
WITH POWERFUL ALLIES IN THE USG AND OTHER COUNTRIES THAT
SUPPORT A CONVENTION ADDRESSING A COMPREHENSIVE BAN. IN THIS
CASE, THE CAUTION REFLECTS NOT ONLY THE HOLY SEE'S
PRAGMATISM, BUT ALSO THE EXTREME IMPORTANCE THE HOLY SEE
ATTACHES TO A BAN ON HUMAN REPRODUCTIVE CLONING AND DESIRE TO
ACHIEVE AGREEMENT ON SUCH A BAN. WE ARE CONFIDENT THE HOLY
SEE WILL ENCOURAGE ITS UN OBSERVER IN NEW YORK AND NUNCIOS IN
POLAND, THE PHILIPPINES, HONDURAS, ZIMBABWE, AND IVORY COAST
TO APPROACH THE HOST GOVERNMENTS TO SEEK OUT SUPPORT FOR OUR
APPROACH TO THE ISSUE, AND MIGLIORE HAS AGREED TO UPDATE US
ON THEIR DISCUSSIONS. WITH THEIR FINGER TO THE WIND,
HOWEVER, THEY WILL TURN TO THEIR COMPROMISE IF THEY DEEM IT
NECESSARY PRESERVE THE CHANCE FOR A FUTURE GLOBAL BAN.
NICHOLSON
SKODON

UNCLASSIFIED

>

2002VATICA04241 - Classification: UNCLASSIFIED